Preliminary Syllabus

Immigration, Integration, and Multiculturalism in the West

Fall 2021

Instructor: Salma Mousa

Office hours: Tuesdays 2 – 4pm.

Email: salma.mousa@yale.edu

Teaching Assistant: James Sundquist

Office hours: Thursday evenings in the Bass Library café, 6-8pm.

Email: james.sundquist@yale.edu

**Course description**

What are the different social models of managing a multicultural society? How do immigrants experience the integration process? Do immigrants assimilate? What determines the attitudes of native-born communities toward immigrants? What are the political and social effects of immigration? Are immigrants good or bad for local economies? Does the presence of immigrants fuel far-right movements? Which policy tools encourage integration, and which can spur backlash? These are some of the questions we will investigate together by reviewing the evidence base on immigration, integration, and multiculturalism. This course emphasizes research design and statistical methods for moving beyond correlations and toward understanding the causal effects of immigration and immigration policy.

**Goals**

The course has four principal learning objectives:

1. Introduce students to normative and policy debates around different social models of integration, such as multiculturalism and assimilation;
2. Review and synthesize a selection of the most important areas of research around immigration and integration;
3. Train students how to critically evaluate evidence as the basis of informed opinions on policy debates, with an emphasis on distinguishing between correlation and causality;
4. Train students on the basics of quantitative research analysis using real-world data and statistical software.

**Prerequisites**

No prior courses, nor prior statistical or coding experience, are needed.

**Evaluation**

The final grade consists of four components:

* Class participation (10%): Students are expected to attend every class, to actively participate in class discussion and to have read all of the required readings in advance of class.
* Four assignments (30%): Assignments will have two components. One will be data-based: you will use the statistical software R to analyze data and apply the methods used in the papers presented during lecture. The second component is substantive: you will be asked to provide a critical answer to a question related to the data analysis task and to the content of previous lectures. Assignments will be distributed before class, and are due by 9am one week after distribution. The dates below are provisional. Late assignments will not be accepted. Please send your answers to the instructor and the TA in .pdf format and include your annotated R code together with your written responses.
  + Assignment 1:
    - Distributed: September 14
    - Due: September 21
  + Assignment 2:
    - Distributed : September 28
    - Due: October 5
  + Assignment 3:
    - Distributed: November 9
    - Due: November 16
  + Assignment 4:
    - Distributed: November 30
    - Due: December 7
* Midterm (25%): The mid-term is a take-home exam. It will be distributed on October 28 and you will have 24 hours to complete it.
* Final paper (35)%: The final paper will be a critical review of a research question, draws from the readings discussed in class, and additional papers provided by the instructor. You will be asked to choose from a list of proposed research questions.

**Required Books**

There is no required textbook for the class. A useful book on the basics of understanding causality is Mastering Metrics, by Joshua A. Angrist and Jorn-Steffen Pischke (Princeton And Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2015). Relevant sections of this book, as well as all other required readings will be available on the course website.

**Collaboration**

Collaboration is encouraged as you work on your assignments. However, you should write up on your own any final answers that you submit, indicate on the top of your assignment the names of classmates you collaborated with. No collaboration is allowed on the midterm or the final exam.

**Course Policies**

*COVID-19*

Living through a pandemic has been incredibly challenging for all of us. Please communicate any challenges you are facing, or any comments you have on how the course structure can be improved, as soon as possible.

*Attendance*

Attending all lectures and discussion sections is required. Please communicate absences ahead of class when possible. Keep in mind that participation is worth 10% of your final grade. If you miss section for an approved reason, you will need to write a 500 word reflection paper on the week’s readings.

*E-mail*

If you have a quick (i.e. non-substantive) question, email is the best way to contact me or your TA. While I typically respond to emails quickly, please allow 48 hours for a response. If you do not receive a response within 48 hours, follow up with a reminder.

*Late Assignments*

For every day a written assignment is late, you will lose a fraction of a letter grade for that assignment (e.g. B to B-).

*Academic Integrity*

It is your responsibility to be aware of Yale University's policy on academic integrity. In short, don't turn in the same paper for two classes, don’t collaborate on assignments without explicitly indicating that you have collaborated, don't plagiarize someone else's work, and don't cheat on the inclass exam or other assignments. When in doubt, check the guidelines [here](http://ctl.yale.edu/writing/using-sources) or ask me.

*Students with Disabilities*

If you have already established accommodations with the Resource Office on Disabilities, let me and your TA know. If you have not yet established services through ROD, but have a temporary health condition or permanent disability that requires accommodations, please contact ROD.

*Commitment to an Inclusive Learning Environment*

Yale University adheres to the philosophy that all community members should enjoy an environment free of any harassment, sexual misconduct, discrimination, or violence. If you encounter sexual harassment, sexual misconduct, sexual assault, or discrimination based on race, color, religion, age, national origin, ancestry, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, or disability please contact the Title IX Coordinator, Stephanie Spangler, or any of the University Title IX Coordinators. You may also report an incident to me. I am required to notify the Title IX coordinator about the basic facts of the incident, though you may choose to request confidentiality from the University.

**Preliminary Course Outline and Readings**

**Week 1: Introduction to Immigration and Causal Inference**

*September 2: Immigration Debates*

* Borjas, G. (2016). “Yes, Immigration Hurts American Workers,” *Politico.* [Link](https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2016/09/trump-clinton-immigration-economy-unemployment-jobs-214216/).
* Baker, S. R., N. Bloom, and S. Davis (2015). “Immigration Fears and Policy Uncertainty,” *VoxEU*. [Link](https://voxeu.org/article/how-immigration-benefits-natives).
* Battisti, M, and Felbermayr, M, and Peri, M, and Poutvaara, P (2014). “How immigration benefits natives despite labour market imperfections and income redistribution,” *VoxEU*. [Link](https://voxeu.org/article/how-immigration-benefits-natives).
* Portes, J (2019). “Tragedy is inevitable if we fear migration rather than celebrate its benefits,” *The Guardian*. [Link](https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2019/jun/30/tragedy-is-inevitable-if-we-fear-migration-rather-than-celebrate-its-benefits).

*September 7: Causality*

* Gerber, A. S., and Green, D. P. (2012). *Field experiments: Design, analysis, and interpretation*. WW Norton. Chapter 1 (Introduction).
* Angrist, J. D., and Pischke, J. S. (2014). *Mastering 'metrics: The path from cause to effect*. Princeton University Press. Chapter 2, pp. 47-81.

**Week 2: Do immigrants integrate?**

*September 9: History of Immigration in the U.S.*

* Abramitzky, R., and Boustan, L (2017). “Immigration in American Economic History.” *The Journal of Economic Literature.*
* Massey, D. S. and K. A. Pren (2012). “Unintended Consequences of US Immigration Policy: Explaining the Post-1965 Surge from Latin America.” *Population and Development Review*, 38(1), 1-29.
* Fouka, V., Mazumder, S., Tabellini, M (2021). “From Immigrants to Americans: Race and Assimilation during the Great Migration.” *The Review of Economic Studies*.

*September 14: Social and Political Integration Trends*

* Unigwe, Chika. (2015). “The Near-Impossibility of Assimilation in Belgium.” *The New York Times Magazine*. 11/25/2015.
* Abramitzky, R., L. P. Boustan, and K. Eriksson (2020). “Do Immigrants Assimilate More Slowly Today than in the Past?” *American Economic Review.*
* Manning, A., and Roy, S. (2010). “Culture Clash or Culture Club? National Identity in Britain.” *The Economic Journal*, 120(542)
* Dancygier, R. M., Lindgren, K. O., Oskarsson, S., and Vernby, K. (2015). “Why are Immigrants Underrepresented in Politics? Evidence from Sweden.” *American Political Science Review*, 109(4), 703-724.

*Optional reading*

* Foged, M., Hasager, L., & Yasenov, V. (2019). The role of institutions in the labor market impact of immigration.
* Harder, N., Figueroa, L., Gillum, R. M., Hangartner, D., Laitin, D. D., and Hainmueller, J. (2018). Multidimensional Measure of Immigrant Integration. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 115(45), 11483-11488.
* Åslund, Olof, and Dan‐Olof Rooth. “Do when and where matter? Initial labour market conditions and immigrant earnings.” *The Economic Journal* 117, no. 518 (2007): 422-448.

**Week 3: Do immigrants experience discrimination?**

*September 16:*

* Kaas, Leo, and Christian Manger. “Ethnic discrimination in Germany’s labour market: a field experiment.” *German economic review* 13, no. 1 (2012): 1-20.
* Hangartner, Dominik, Kopp, Daniel and Siegenthaler, Michael (2020) Monitoring hiring discrimination through online recruitment platforms. Forthcoming in *Nature*.
* Hainmueller, Jens, and Dominik Hangartner. “Who gets a Swiss passport? A natural experiment in immigrant discrimination*.” American political science review* 107, no. 1 (2013): 159-187.

*September 21: Flipped classroom – statistical vs. taste-based discrimination exercise*

**Week 4: What are the economic effects of immigration?**

*September 23: Effects on native-born wages*

* Card, D. “The impact of the Mariel boatlift on the Miami labor market.” ILR Review 43, no. 2 (1990): 245-257.
* Borjas, G. J. (2017). The Wage Impact of the Marielitos: A Reappraisal. *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, 70(5), 1077-1110.
* Matthews, D. “The most important debate in immigration economics right now, explained,” *Vox*, 10/21/2015.
* Frum, D. “The Great Immigration Data Debate,” *The Atlantic*, 1/19/2016.

*September 28: Macroeconomic effects*

* Card, D. (2005). Is the New Immigration Really so Bad? *The Economic Journal*, 115(507): F300-323.
* National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. (2017). The Economic and Fiscal Consequences of Immigration. National Academies Press. Chapter 5.
* Alesina, A., J. Harnoss, and H. Rapoport (2016). “Birthplace Diversity and Economic Prosperity.” *Journal of Economic Growth*, 21(2), 101-138.

*Optional reading*

* Foged, Mette, and Giovanni Peri. Immigrants’ effect on native workers: New analysis on longitudinal data. *American Economic Journal*: Applied Economics 8, no. 2 (2016): 1-34.

**Week 5: What are the political effects of immigration?**

*September 30: Political attitudes*

* Steinmayr, Andreas. “Exposure to refugees and voting for the far-right:(Unexpected) results from Austria.” (2020).
* Hangartner, Dominik, Elias Dinas, Moritz Marbach, Konstantinos Matakos, and Dimitrios Xefteris. “Does exposure to the refugee crisis make natives more hostile?.” *American Political Science Review* 113, no. 2 (2019): 442-455.
* Giuliano, P., & Tabellini, M. (2020). The Seeds of Ideology: Historical Immigration and Political Preferences in the United States (No. w27238). *National Bureau of Economic Research*.

*October 5: Crime*

*Guest lecture: Dan Masterson, UC Santa Barbara*

* Bell, Brian, Francesco Fasani, and Stephen Machin. “Crime and immigration: Evidence from large immigrant waves.” *Review of Economics and statistics* 21, no. 3 (2013): 1278-1290.
* Masterson, D., & Yasenov, V. (20121). “Does halting refugee resettlement reduce crime? Evidence from the United States refugee ban.” American Political Science Review, 1-8.

**Week 6: How does diversity shape social cohesion?**

*October 7: Social capital*

* Alesina, A. and E. La Ferrara (2000). “Participation in Heterogeneous Communities”, *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 115 (3), 847-904.
* Putnam, R. D. (2007). “E Pluribus Unum: Diversity and Community in the Twenty first Century.” The 2006 Johan Skytte Prize Lecture. *Scandinavian Political Studies*, 30(2), 137-174.

*October 12: Building national unity*

* Francis Fukuyama, “Identity, Immigration, and Liberal Democracy,” (The 2005 Seymour Martin Lipset Lecture) *Journal of Democracy* 17(2), 2006: 5-20.
* The Economist, “Racism tests France’s colour-blind model.” January 16, 2021.
* Bazzi, S., A. Gaduh, A. Rothenberg, and M. Wong (2019). “Unity in Diversity? How Intergroup Contact Can Foster Nation Building.” *American Economic Review*, 109(11), 3978-4025.

*Optional reading*

* Charnysh, V. (2019). “Diversity, Institutions, and Economic Outcomes: Post-WWII Displacement in Poland.” *American Political Science Review*, 113 (12): 423-441.

**Week 7: What determines attitudes toward immigrants?**

*October 14: Economic determinants*

* Scheve, Kenneth F., and Matthew J. Slaughter. “Labor market competition and individual preferences over immigration policy.” *Review of Economics and Statistics* 83, no. 1 (2001): 133-145.
* Hainmueller, J., M. J. Hiscox, and Y. Margalit (2015). “Do Concerns about Labor Market Competition Shape Attitudes toward Immigration? New Evidence." *Journal of International Economics* 97(1):193-207.
* Malhotra, Neil, Yotam Margalit, and Cecilia Hyunjung Mo. “Economic explanations for opposition to immigration: Distinguishing between prevalence and conditional impact.” *American Journal of Political Science* 57, no. 2 (2013): 391-410.

*October 19: Social determinants*

* Bansak, Kirk, Jens Hainmueller, and Dominik Hangartner. “How economic, humanitarian, and religious concerns shape European attitudes toward asylum seekers.” *Science* 354, no. 6309 (2016): 217-222.
* Clayton, K., and Ferwerda, J., and Horiuchi, Y (2014). “Exposure to Immigration and Admission Preferences: Evidence From France.” *Political Behavior*, forthcoming.
* Hainmueller, Jens, and Daniel J. Hopkins. “Public attitudes toward immigration.” *Annual Review of Political Science* 17 (2014): 225-249.

**Week 8: How does the national political climate shape attitudes toward immigrants?**

*October 21: No class*

*October 26: Macropolitical climate*

* Hopkins, D. J. (2010). “Politicized Places: Explaining where and when Immigrants Provoke Local Opposition.” *American Political Science Review*, 104(1), 40-60.
* Fouka, V., Mazumder, S., & Tabellini, M. (2020). From immigrants to Americans: Race and assimilation during the Great Migration. Working paper.
* Sønderskov, Kim Mannemar and Jens Peter Frølund Thomsen. 2015. “Contextualizing intergroup contact: do political party cues enhance contact effects?” *Social Psychology* Quarterly 78(1):49–76.

*October 28: Elite rhetoric*

*Midterm distributed after class, due 24 hours later*

* Crandall CS, Miller JM, White MH. “Changing Norms Following the 2016 U.S. Presidential Election: The Trump Effect on Prejudice.” *Social Psychological and Personality Science*. 2018; 9(2):186-192.
* Tesler and Sides. 2016. “How political science helps explain the rise of Trump: white identity and grievances.” *Washington Post.*
* Sniderman, P. M., L. Hagendoorn, and M. Prior (2004). “Predisposing Factors and Situational Triggers: Exclusionary Reactions to Immigrant Minorities.” *American Political Science Review* 98(1): 35-49.

**Week 9: How can we reduce prejudice toward immigrants?**

*November 2: Intergroup contact*

* Alrababah, A, Marble, W, Mousa, A, Siegel, A (2021). “Can exposure to celebrities reduce prejudice? The effect of Mohamed Salah on Islamophobic behaviors and attitudes.” *American Political Science Review.*
* Finseraas, H. and Kotsadam, A. (2017). “Does personal contact with ethnic minorities affect anti‐immigrant sentiments? Evidence from a field experiment.” *European Journal of Political Research*, 56(3), pp.703-722.
* Enos, R. D. (2014). “Causal Effect of Intergroup Contact on Exclusionary Attitudes.” *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 111(10), 3699-3704.
* Andersson, Henrik, Sirus H Dehdari et al. (2021). “Workplace Contact and Support for Anti-Immigration Parties.” *American Political Science Review*, 1-16.

*November 4: Building empathy*

*Guest lecture: Scott Williamson, Bocconi University*

* Kalla, Joshua L., and David E. Broockman. “Reducing exclusionary attitudes through interpersonal conversation: evidence from three field experiments.” *American Political Science Review* 114, no. 2 (2020): 410-425.
* Claire L. Adida, Adeline Lo, Melina R. Platas. “Perspective taking can promote short-term inclusionary behavior toward Syrian refugees*.” Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences Sep 2018, 115 (38) 9521-9526.*
* Simonivits, G., Kezdi, G., & Kardos, P. (2018). ”Seeing the World Through the Other's Eye: An Online Intervention Reducing Ethnic Prejudice.” *American Political Science Review*, 112(1), 186-193.
* Williamson, S., Adida, C. L., Lo, A., Platas, M., Prather, L., & Werfel, S. H. (2020). “Increasing immigrant inclusion: Family history, empathy, and immigration in the United States.”

*Optional readings*

* Mousa, Salma. “Building social cohesion between Christians and Muslims through soccer in post-ISIS Iraq.” *Science* 369, no. 6505 (2020): 866-870.
* Vertier, Paul and Viskanic, Max and Gamalerio, Matteo, Dismantling the 'Jungle': Migrant Relocation and Extreme Voting in France (December 16, 2020). Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2963641> or [http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2963641](https://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2963641)
* Dinas, E., & Fouka, V. (2018). “Family history and attitudes toward outgroups: Evidence from the Syrian refugee crisis.” Available at SSRN 3102093.
* Weiss, C. (2019). “Curing Prejudice through Representative Bureaucracies: Evidence From A Natural Experiment in Israeli Medical Clinics” Working paper.

**Week 10: Is there a “Muslim challenge” to integration?**

*November 9: Muslim integration*

* Bisin, A., Patacchini, E., Verdier, T., and Zenou, Y. (2008). “Are Muslim Immigrants Different in Terms of Cultural Integration?” *Journal of the European Economic Association*, 6(23), 445-456.
* Gould, E. D., and E. F. Klor (2016). The Long-Run Effect of 9/11: Terrorism, Backlash, and the Assimilation of Muslim Immigrants in the West. *The Economic Journal* 126(597): 2064-2114.
* Mitts, T. (2018). From Isolation to Radicalization: Anti-Muslim Hostility and Support for ISIS in the West. *American Political Science Review*. 113(1), 173-194.
* Choi, D., Poertner, M, and Sambanis, N (2021). “The Hijab Penalty: Feminist Backlash to Muslim Immigrants,” *American Political Science Review.*

*November 11: The French Case*

* Adida, C. L., Laitin, D. D., and Valfort, M. A. (2010). Identifying Barriers to Muslim Integration in France. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 107(52), 22384-22390.
* The Daily (podcast), “France, Islam, and Laïcité.” Feb 12, 2021.
* Emeriau, M., & Laitin, D. D. (2020). “Integration Failures in France: A Search for Mechanisms.” IPL Working Paper no. 20-03.

*Optional Readings*

* Dancygier, R. M. (2017). Dilemmas of Inclusion: Muslims in European Politics. Princeton University Press.
* Lægaard, S. (2007), “The Cartoon Controversy: Offence, Identity, Oppression?” *Political Studies*, Vol. 55, No. 3, pp. 481- 498.
* Adida, C.L., Laitin, D.D. and Valfort, M.A., 2014. Muslims in France: identifying a discriminatory equilibrium. *Journal of Population Economics*, 27(4), pp.1039-1086.

**Week 11: How does citizenship policy shape integration?**

*November 16: Access to citizenship*

* Gathmann, Christina, and Nicolas Keller. “Access to citizenship and the economic assimilation of immigrants.” *The Economic Journal* 128, no. 616 (2018): 3141-3181.
* V. Yasenov, M. Hotard, D. Lawrence, J. Hainmueller and D. Laitin (2019). “Standardizing the Fee-Waiver Application Increased Naturalization Rates of Low-Income Immigrants.” *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 115 Vol 116(34), pp 16768-16772.

*Guest lecture: Vasil Yasenov, Stanford University*

*November 18: Effects of citizenship*

* Hainmueller, J, Hangartner, D and Pietrantuono, G. “Catalyst or crown: Does  
  naturalization promote the long-term social integration of immigrants?.” *American Political Science Review* 111, no. 2 (2017): 256-276.
* Hainmueller, J., Hangartner, D., and Pietrantuono, G. (2015). “Naturalization Fosters the Longterm Political Integration of Immigrants.” *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 112(41), 12651-12656.

*Optional Readings*

* Hainmueller, J, Lawrence, D, Gest, J, Hotard, M, Koslowski, R, and Laitin, D. “A randomized controlled design reveals barriers to citizenship for low-income  
  immigrants*.” Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 115, no. 5 (2018): 939-944.

**Week 12: Do assimilation policies spur backlash?**

*November 23 and 25: No class*

*November 30:*

*Guest Lecture: Aala Abdelgadir*

* Fouka, Vasiliki. “Backlash: The unintended effects of language prohibition in US schools after World War I.” *The Review of Economic Studies* 87, no. 1 (2020): 204-239.
* Fouka, V. (2019). “How do immigrants respond to discrimination? The case of Germans in the US during World War I.” *American Political Science Review*, 113(2), 405-422.
* Abdelgadir, Aala, and Vasiliki Fouka. “Political Secularism and Muslim Integration in the West: Assessing the Effects of the French Headscarf Ban.” *American Political Science Review*114, no. 3 (2020): 707-723.

**Week 13: What are the obstacles and opportunities for refugee integration?**

*December 2: Social networks*

* Edin, Per-Anders, Peter Fredriksson, and Olof Åslund. “Ethnic enclaves and the economic success of immigrants—Evidence from a natural experiment.” The quarterly journal of economics118, no. 1 (2003): 329-357.
* Beaman, Lori A. “Social networks and the dynamics of labour market outcomes: Evidence from refugees resettled in the US.” *The Review of Economic Studies* 79, no. 1 (2012): 128-161.
* Martén, Linna, Jens Hainmueller, and Dominik Hangartner. “Ethnic networks can foster the economic integration of refugees.” Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences116, no. 33 (2019): 16280- 16285.

*December 7: Policy tools*

* Bansak, Kirk, Jeremy Ferwerda, Jens Hainmueller, Andrea Dillon, Dominik Hangartner, Duncan Lawrence, and Jeremy Weinstein. “Improving refugee integration through data-driven algorithmic assignment.” *Science* 359, no. 6373 (2018): 325-329.
* Marbach, M, Hainmueller, J and Hangartner, D. “The long-term impact of employment bans on the economic integration of refugees.” *Science Advances* 4, no. 9.
* Hainmueller, J, Hangartner, D and Lawrence, D (2016). “When lives are put on hold: Lengthy asylum processes decrease employment among refugees.” *Science Advances* 2, no. 8.

*Optional readings*

* Fasani, F, Frattini, T, and Minale, L (2020). “Lift the Ban? Initial Employment Restrictions and Refugee Labour Market Outcomes.”
* Arendt, J.N (2020). “Labor market effects of a work-first policy for refugees.” *Journal of Population Economics*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00148-020-00808-z>

*December 9: Final Review*

*December 17: Final distributed (due December 22)*